7

Manoj Sankaranarayana Texts and Physicians in Keralan Ayurveda: the Case of the Rescue Clyster

Introduction

In this chapter, I attempt to show the relevance of textual studies to clinical Ayurvedic practice by looking at the case of the Rescue Clyster (*vaitaraṇavasti*), a commonly-practised enema (*vasti*) formulation in Kerala. I consider how the different enema formulations and current variation in clinical practice among Ayurvedic physicians in Kerala reflect the

I offer my pranāmas to my guru, Padmaśrī Dr K. Rajagopalan, who gave back to the Ayurveda community the highly effective vaitaranavasti. I dedicate this paper to his lotus feet. I also express my sincere gratitude to Dr P. Ram Manohar and the Arya Vaidya Pharmacy, Coimbatore, for providing me with an opportunity to present this paper. My sincere thanks to Dr P. K. Varrier, Dr P. Madhavankutty Varrier and Dr E. Surendran, Arya Vaidya Sala, Kottakkal, for giving me a chance to present my observations on the practice of the rescue clyster in Keralan Ayurveda; Dr P. T. N. Vasudevan Mooss and Dr Narayanan Nambi, S. N. A. Oushadhasala, Thrissur, for providing an opportunity to present my study at the Unni Mooss Dinam Seminar 2010. This paper would not have assumed its current form without the editorial input of Dr Dominik Wujastyk. I am short of words to express my gratitude to him. Last but not least, I wish to express my gratitude to all the members of the Classical Ayurveda Text Study Group (CATS) for motivating us to take up textual studies through their inspiring work.

ways in which Ayurvedic practice arose from established theoretical foundations. I deal with Ayurvedic clinical practice here from both a text-historical perspective and from the perspective of a practicing, clinical physician.

In the following pages, I trace the appearance of the Rescue Clyster (*vaitaraṇavasti*) in the medical literature of Ayurveda up to the present, as well as the current practice of enema among physicians in Kerala. I also consider the extent to which the evolution of contemporary practice is reflected in Ayurvedic literature.¹

The Rescue Clyster became popular following the research of P. Sankarankutty, M. R. Vasudevan Namboodiri and V. K. Sasikumar at the Government Ayurveda College in 1991.² Their work was inspired by Dr K. Rajagopalan's compilation of enema therapies (*vastiyoga*).³ The practice of this type of enema (*vasti*) varies considerably from institution to institution and from individual to individual. For example, the formulation used for performing the Rescue Clyster in the Government Ayurveda College, Thiruvanantapuram, is in Table 7.1. In the Central Institute of Pañcakarma, Cheruthuruty, 450 ml of *kṣīra* or cow's urine (*gomūtra*) is used, while the measurements for the rest are the same. To make sense of the variations of this practice, a thorough scrutiny of textual references related to its formula is necessary.

The *Carakasamhitā* is an important Sanskrit medical source for Ayurvedic clinical practice. According to Caraka,

¹Although care is taken to present the facts objectively, the absence of a systematic codification of clinical research means that the paper may carry some minor misrepresentations regarding the practice of the Rescue Clyster.

²Sasikumar et al. 1991.

³Personal communication with Dr P. Sankarankutty, Dr V. K. Sasikumar, and Dr T. K. Sudarshanan Nair.

sea salt (<i>saindhava</i>)	15 g
jaggery (guḍa)	30 g
tamarind (<i>amlikā</i>)	60 g
sesame oil (<i>taila</i>)	120 ml
cow's urine (gomūtra)	
or	
thickened milk (ksira)	240 ml

Table 7.1: Vaitaraņavasti in Thiruvanantapuram

medical practice is far more than mere acquaintance with the healing properties of medicinal herbs.

Practice depends on time and measure, and success is founded on practice. A person who knows practice always stands at the head of those who know about drugs.⁴

It is elimination therapy (*śodhanacikitsā*), and such therapies that form the basis of Ayurveda. Another work, the *Narasiṃhabhāṣya*, a unique commentary by Narasiṃha on the *Rasavaiśeṣikasūtra*, datable perhaps to the seventh or eighth century CE, has left a great impact on the Ayurveda fraternity of Kerala.⁵ In general, this commentary serves as an authoritative interpretation (*vārttika*) applicable to the whole Ayurveda of eight components (*aṣṭāngāyurveda*), and specifically to the branch of Ayurveda dealing with internal medicine (*kāyacikitsā*). The *Narasiṃhabhāṣya* reveals the special status enjoyed by internal medicine due to the inclusion of elimination therapies (*pañcakarma*) in this branch.

⁴*Carakasa*mhitā Sū 2.16 (Ācārya 1941: 25b): mātrākālāśrayā yuktih siddhir yuktau pratisthitā | tisthaty upari yuktijno dravyajnānavatām sadā | | (tr. DW).

⁵On the date of *Narasimhabhāsya*, see Meulenbeld 1999–2002: IIA, 138.

Purificatory therapy (*śodhanacikitsā*), also known as the fivefold elimination therapy (*pañcakarma*), was regarded in high esteem by Narasimha, and all branches of Ayurveda utilised the purificatory therapy.⁶ In his exhaustive work *A History of Indian Medical Literature* (henceforth *HIML*), Meulenbeld cites only two self-contained, original texts in this regard, both on five-fold elimination therapy (*pañcakarma*), the *Pañcakarmavicāra* and *Pañcakarmavidhi*.⁷ Furthermore, manuscript copies of a work entitled *Pañcakarmādhikāra* are found in libraries in Calcutta.⁸ The dearth of knowledge among physicians about the ideal practice of *pañcakarma* has created a new scenario in which the procedure of enema itself has created many iatrogenic complications (diseases caused by five-fold elimination therapy).⁹

As a part of the elimination procedure of *pañcakarma*, enema (*vasti*) has been given special status from the classical period onwards. In his *Āyurvedasaukhyaṃ*, Țoḍaramalla (*fl. ca.* 1550–1589) refers to a school of thought propounded

⁶See, for example, Narasimhabhāşya 1.1 (Muthuswami 1976: 2), asserting the primacy of internal medicine (kāyacikitsā) and purificatory regimes: pūrvaprakŗtā hy atra grhītatantraśarīrā viśeṣārthajijñāsavo martyāḥ| teṣām anumatyartham uktam iti| evam vārttikaprayojanam api dyotitam bhavati viśeṣārthaprakāśanam iti| bhavati cātra sūtrārthānām upapattisūcanāt tatparihāravacanam, viśeṣārthadarśanam ca vārttikam iti| atrāha – kasyedam vārttikam iti| aṣṭāngasyāyurvedasya sakalasya, ārogyaśāstram vyākhyāsyāma ity aviśeṣeṇoktatvāt sarvatantrapadārthasamgrahāc ca| athavā viśeṣataḥ kāyacikitsāyāḥ|

⁷*HIML*: IIA, 525; cf. Raghavan *et al.* 1949–: 11, 8a. A manuscript of the *Pañcakarmavicāra* in Telugu script is OLM Accession Number P8734/6, Government Oriental Library, Mysore.

⁸Rama Rao (2005: p. 170, serial no. #1741) records four manuscripts: Asiatic Society Calcutta, acc. no. IE 45; Calcutta Sanskrit College Library acc. no. 248, and also acc. nos. 171 and 189 ascribed to a Vijayarakşita.

⁹Śārngadharasamhitā prathamakhanda 7, v. 193cd-194ab (Śāstrī 1931:132): hīnamithyātiyogena bhedaih pañcadaśoditāh pañcakarmabhavā rogā rogesv eva prakīrtitāh

by Atri that deems enema therapy (*vasticikitsā*) to be an independent, ninth branch of Ayurveda.¹⁰ He explains that enema therapy (*vasticikitsā*) is included under the internal therapy (*kāyacikitsā*) branch of Ayurveda found in the compendia of Caraka and Suśruta.¹¹ From a textual-historical perspective, this strongly suggests that the practice of enema in Ayurvedic clinical practice is significant.

Vasti in Kerala

The legacy handed down by Kerala's Ayurvedic physicians is a vibrant clinical practice, well-rooted in the fundamental principles of the Sanskrit medical classics. This observation can be established by a cursory examination of Kerala's rich literary tradition, which focuses on the fundamental principles of the Sanskrit medical sources as well as the clinical application of those sources. The literary contribution from Kerala includes various commentaries (especially on the *Aṣṭānˈgahṛdaya Saṃhitā*), treatises on poison treatment (*viṣacikitsā*), paediatrics (*bālacikitsā*), and various other books on clinical practice written in both Sanskrit and mixed Sanskrit and Malayālam (*maṇipravālaṃ*). Yet, the teaching of Ayurveda in Kerala does not contribute much to the schemata of purification therapy (*śodhanacikitsā*).¹² This reminds us of

¹⁰ Āyurvedasaukhyam 1.37 (Dash and Kashyap 1992: 61): atri mate navaprakārikā cikitsā carakasuśrutādibhir visopaśamanārtham yā agadā nāma kriyā proktā saivātriņā basticikitsā kṛtā|, and 1.38: gudāmayānām yā bastih śamanam ca nirūham | āsthāpanānuvasaś ca agadam nāma kathyate|

¹¹Āyurvedasaukhyaņi 1.39 (Dash and Kashyap 1992: 62): suśrutādīnāņi mate basticikitsā kāyacikitsāntarbhūtaiva ato 'tra mayā na aņingīkārah krtah 39

¹²For example, in the *Yogāmṛta* (15th–17th century CE, edited by Nambiyār Vaidyar (1960)), a handbook for clinical practice, enema (*vasti*) is used as a therapeutic tool in only six instances: (1) ileus (*udāvarta*), where constipation is experienced even after doing oil massage (*abhyanga*), applying a hot poultice (*piṇḍasveda*) and an anal wick (*gudavarti*), enema

the statement by Cakrapāṇidatta (*fl. ca.* 1075), which points to the declining importance of enema in Ayurvedic practice during his period.¹³

Many formulae for the preparation of enemas that are available in the compendia of Caraka and others were not included in this treatise as they are no longer utilised in current routine clinical practice.

Many formulae for the preparation of enemas that are available in the compendia of Caraka and other preceptors were not elaborated in this treatise as they were no longer utilised in the routine clinical practice by that time. Niścalakara (*fl. ca.* 1150–1200) and Śivadāsasena (*fl. ca.* 1475–1500), commentators on Cakrapāṇidatta's work, explain the word "chiefly" (*prāyo*) as suggestive of the clinical utilisation, in appropriate conditions, from the list of enema compounds (*vastiyoga*) enumerated in the classical treatises. This statement by the commentators does not negate the importance of Cakrapāṇi's observance regarding enema. This bold admission by Cakrapāṇidatta does not mean that later treatises do not add any novel formulae on enema (*vasti*). For example, the *Vṛndamādhava* (also known as *Siddhayoga*, composed ca. 800–950), that preceded Cakrapāṇidatta,

¹³Cikitsāsangraha 71.34 (Sharma 1993: 864): carakād yo samuddiṣṭāḥ bastayo ye sahasraśaḥ| vyavahāro na taiḥ prāyo nibaddhā nātra tena te.

has to be carried out (ch. 17, v. 40). (2) When hernial enlargement (*antra-vṛddhi*) approaches the groin, it is incurable, but can be maintained in a palliable (*yāpya*) state by treatments which also include enema (*vasti*) (29, v. 16). (3) A swelling in the seat of digested food (*pakvāśayagatagulma*) is treated by vasti (30, vv. 1, 6). (4) The application of an enema (*vastikarma*) is indicated in *pakṣāghāta* and *ākṣepaka* (40, vv. 18, 21). (5) In wind attack in the sides and back (*kaṭipṛṣṭagatavāta*), dominated by pain, enema is indicated (40, vv. 46, 48, 49). (6) The application of an enema (*vastikarma*) is also indicated in gripes (*śūla*) (43, v. 17).

had introduced newer enema formulations of alkali enema (*kṣāravasti*), the Rescue Clyster, etc.

In the recent history of Kerala's Ayurvedic practice, especially in the former princely state of Travancore, laudable contributions have been made in the area of drug studies, clinical researches, and publications by physicians of Certhala Taluk.¹⁴ Their field of interest also included purification therapy (*śodhanacikitsā*), and these physicians published many pioneering works in the field of elimination therapies (*pañcakarma*), such as Pāṇāvalli C. Kṛṣṇanvaidyan's *Vastipradīpam* and Manakoḍaṃ Keśavan-vaidyan's *Pañcakarma athavā śodhanacikitsā*.¹⁵ The presence of an uninterrupted Aṣṭavaidya lineage in Kerala that preserved and enhanced Vāgbhaṭa's clinical treatises and the works of the Certhala Taluk physicians gave a new lease on life to the speciality of purification therapy (*śodhanacikitsā*).

P. S. Varier was perhaps the first to write about Ayurvedic therapies specific to Kerala, when he discussed the topic of flow therapy $(dh\bar{a}r\bar{a})$ in the Malayalam journal *Dhanwantari* in 1906. But the publication of formal literature devoted to the specialised treatment therapeutic procedures of Kerala in all likelihood began in 1913 with the publication of the *Dhārākalpa*.¹⁶ This was followed by P. Raman Menon's Śrī Śirasekādividhi,¹⁷ N. S. Mooss's monograph on the specialised treatment procedures of Kerala,¹⁸ and Aryavaidyan S. Raghunatha Iyer's Sanskrit

¹⁴Ețți Acyutan, a physician hailing from Certhala Taluk, contributed significantly to the compilation of historic work *Hortus Malabaricus* of van Rheede (1678–1703).

¹⁵Kṛṣṇanvaidyan 1988 and Keśavanvaidyan 1993.

¹⁶Nīlakaņțhaśarma and Ācārya 1913.

¹⁷Menon 1929/1930.

¹⁸Mooss 1983.

work on specialised therapies.¹⁹ All of these activities rekindled interest in specialised treatment procedures, including purification therapy (*śodhanacikitsā*), in Ayurvedic practice both within and outside of the state of Kerala.

The Rescue Clyster (*vaitaraṇavasti*), an enema formulation popular among the current generation of Ayurveda clinicians in Kerala, is not mentioned in the abovementioned works related to enema (*vasti*).²⁰

Vasti formulations in Vangasena's Cikitsāsārasamgraha

The enema formulation in the *Cikitsāsārasamgraha* by Vangasena (*fl*. 1050–1100) was subjected to study in the abovementioned research.²¹ The formula for enema in this text reads:²²

rock salt (<i>sindhujanma</i>)		
or sea salt (<i>saindhavalavaṇa</i>)	one karṣa	12 g
jaggery (guḍa)	half a <i>pala</i>	24 g
tamarind (<i>amlikā</i>)	one <i>pala</i>	48 g
sesame oil (<i>taila</i>)	ișat taila	a little
cow's milk (<i>surabhipayaḥ</i>)	one kuḍava	240 ml

¹⁹Raghunatha Iyer 1972.

²¹For example, by Sasikumar *et al.* 1991.

²⁰Neither Kṛṣṇanvaidyan (1988) nor Keśavanvaidyan (1993) mention this enema (*vasti*) formulation. Caustic enema (*kṣāravasti*) and the Rescue Clyster were not common in the routine clinical practice of Kerala's Aṣṭavaidya tradition.

²² Vangasena bastiprakarana 186–190 (Rāya 1983: 805, Bhattācārya 1893: 947–48): sindhūdbhavasya karşam amlikāyāh palam gudārddhapalam surabhīpayasah kudavah sarvair etaih krto bastih||186|| īşattailayuto 'yam bhukte datte nihanti rogaganam katyūruprsthasotham sūlam cāmānilam ghoram||187|| cirabhavam ūrustambham grdhrasirogam ca jānusamkocam vi-şamajvarāni ghoram klaibyañ ca vināšayaty āsu||188|| bastir vaitaranokto gunaganayuktah suvikhyātah||189|| bhojayitvā ca sāyāhne sarvasyāyam prašasyate| atha ced balavān jantur abhuktvāpi tadā kvacit||190||

While the present study lacks an exhaustive survey of the textual data to support this formulation, it is clear that the formula was furthermore modified by increasing the quantity of milk to two *kudava*. Vangasena's text explains that this increase in the quantity of milk was done to reduce the consistency of the enema so that it can be administered more easily. Sasikumar *et al.* (1991: 105) noted that,

... the modalities of mixing the ingredients are not mentioned. The main impediment of combination of tamarind and milk together. Milk will readily coagulate when combined with tamarind. Also honey and kalka are not mentioned. A viable alternate method is adopted by mixing jaggery in water and evaporating required quantity of water so as to make the solution dense to be used as honey. Sea salt is an ingredient and *tila taila* can be used as *sneha*. Tamarind is mixed and squeezed well in hot water to be used as kalkka. Milk is boiled well and cooled and added at the end to substitute kwatha. The disorganisation is seen very much less when this methodology is followed. The vasti constituted thus will be very thick thus rendering it difficult to negotiate through vasti vantra since only one kudava (app. 250 ml) of milk is added.the problem can be settled by adding 2 kudavas of milk. The constituted vasti is taken in vasti putaka administered. Vaitarana vasti can be given after food in the afternoon like an anuvasana. But if the patient has adequate strength, it can be administered like a niruha also.

The oil used was 120 ml, or approximately two palas.

Confusion regarding the combination of substances in the Rescue Clyster is further complicated when one refers to Śāligrāma Vaiśya's early nineteenth-century Hindi translation of Vaṅgasena's work, that includes cow's urine (*gomūtra*) instead of milk as a necessary constituent.²³ This addition may have been influenced by former medical treatises like *Vṛndamādhava* and *Cakradatta*.²⁴ This ambiguity created two sections among physicians; the division was based on each physician's choice for one of the liquid ingredients, that is, those who preferred cow's urine (*gomūtra*), and the others who preferred milk (*kṣīra*).

The first textual reference to the Rescue Clyster (*vaita-raṇavasti*) is found in the *Vṛndamādhava* (also called the *Sid-dhayoga*):²⁵

kṣāraṃ na ced vaitaranaṃ pradāya dvyahe tryahe vāpy anuvāsanīyaḥ|

The placement of this enema in the *Vrndamādhava* is noteworthy. In the Ānandāśrama edition of this text (Pādhye 1894), the Rescue Clyster is explained in an independent section after the section on non-oily enemas ($nir\bar{u}ha$),²⁶ since this formulation does not satisfy the combination pattern of ingredients observed in the preparation of non-oily en-

²³Jaina 1996: 1000 (reprint of Jaina 1904).

²⁴Jaina 1996: 1000. Cakradatta is placed before Vaṅgasena by some historians.

²⁵Vṛndamādhava ch. 75.3 (Pādhye 1894: 559; cf. also Tivārī 2007). Commenting on this, Śrīkaņṭhadatta explains (Pādhye 1894: 559): yasya virecanam nocitam samcitam ca malam asti tasya tanmalāpagamārtham kşāram vaitaraņam vā bastim dattvānuvāsanam deyam visuddhasya snehabastyupadesāt.

²⁶By contrast, the critical edition of the text by Dr Premvati Tiwari explains it in the non-oily enemas ($nir\bar{u}ha$) section, verses 43–4 (Tivārī 2007).

emas (*nirūhavasti*) (i.e., *mākṣikaṃ*, *lavaṇaṃ*, *snehaṃ*, *kalkaṃ*, and *kvāthaṃ*²⁷) and is of lesser quantity.

The formula given by Vrnda has:²⁸

sea salt (<i>saindhava</i>)	karṣa	12 g
jaggery (guḍa)	śukti	24 g
tamarind (<i>amlīkā</i>)	pala	48 g
cow's urine (gomūtra)	kuḍava	240 ml

The indications of enema formulation are gripes (δula), loose bowels ($an\bar{a}ha$), and windy constipation ($\bar{a}mav\bar{a}ta$). The critical edition of the *Vṛndamādhava* by Tivārī (2007) reports a variant reading, where jaggery (guda) is replaced by asafoetida (hingu).²⁹ Ṭoḍaramalla's *Āyurvedasaukhyaṃ* describes the formula of the Rescue Clyster using verses similar to those in Vṛnda's *Vṛndamādhava*.³⁰ Cakrapāṇidatta also accepts the same formula as Vṛnda.³¹ The text of the *Cikitsāsaṅgraha* as printed in the Sharma (1993) edition, accompanying *Niścalakara*'s commentary, omits the term *īṣat*, and reads: *tailayuto 'yaṃ*.³² But *Niścalakara* seems to

²⁷ Aṣṭāṅgahṛdayasamhitā sūtra, 19.45cd–46ab (Kumte et al. 1995: 279): mākṣikam lavanam sneham kalkam kvātham iti kramāt avapeta nirūhānām eşa samyojane vidhih

²⁸Vrndamādhava 74.43–4 (or 76.1–2 of the vaitaraņabasti section in the edition of Pādhye (1894: 576)): palašuktikarsakudavair amlīkāgudasindhujanmagomūtraih īsattailayuto 'yam bastih sūlān āhāmavātaharah|| bhojayitvā tu sāyāhne sarvasyāyam prašasyate| atha ced balavāñjantur abhuktvāpi tadā kvacit||

²⁹*Ibid.*, Tivārī 2007: 2, 938: ...*amlīkāhingusindhujanmagomūtrai*ļ

³⁰Dash and Kashyap 1980–1992: v. 3, ch. 14, vv. 62–3.

³¹*Cikitsāsangraha* 71.30–31 (Sharma 1993: 863) \simeq (Bhaṭṭācārya and Bhaṭṭācārya 1993: 890–91): palaśuktikarṣakuḍavair amlīkāguḍasindhujanmagomūtreḥ īṣattailayuto 'yaṃ bastiḥ śūlānāhām avātaharaḥ| vaitaraṇaḥ kṣārabastir bhuktecāpi pradīyate

³²*Cikitsāsangraha* 71.31 (Sharma 1993: 863).

accept the reading *iṣattailayuto 'yaṃ*, as he comments on the term *īṣat*.³³ While commenting on this section, *Niścalakara* offers yet another formula for the Rescue Clyster, that he ascribes to an *Āyurvedasāra*.³⁴ The formula amounts to the following:

sea salt (<i>saindhava</i>)	akṣa	12 g
jaggery (<i>guḍa</i>)	pala	48 g
tamarind (<i>ciñcā</i>)	pala	48 g
sesame oil (<i>taila</i>)	pala	48 g
cow's urine (gomūtra)	kuḍava	240 ml

Commentators on the Sanskrit medical sources offer important clues about the composition of the Rescue Clyster formulations. Śrīkaṇṭhadatta (*fl.* 12th century) and Śivadāsasena (*fl. ca.* 1475), commentators on the *Vṛndamādhava* and *Cikitsāsaṅgraha* respectively, explain that even though a measurement of ingredients for enema should be taken as explained in the textual formulae, nevertheless the quantity of cow's urine (*gomūtra*) should be doubled, in accordance with the general rule of interpretation (*paribhāṣā*) about the doubling of liquid ingredients (*dravadvaigu*-

³³Ratnaprabhā (Sharma 1993: 863): *īṣattailam iti palam iti vyavaharanti vṛddhāḥ*| [Since the omission of *'īṣat'* renders the śloka unmetrical, and the word is present in other editions, this may be a slip in the 1993 edition – ed.]

³⁴Niścalakara's Ratnaprabhāţikā on Cikitsāsangraha 71.30-31 (Sharma 1993: 863): yad uktam āyurvedasāre – gomūtrakudavaś caikaś ciñcāgudapalam palam satailam saindhavasyākṣam ete vaitaranāhvayah krte bhukte prayukto 'yam śotham mandāgnitām jayet grdhrasījānusankocasamstambham vişamajvaram [Sharma (1993: 15) identifies the author of the Āyurvedasāra, that Niścala also cites elsewhere, as Acyuta, on whom see Raghavan et al. (1949-: 2.153b) – ed.]

nyam).³⁵ In other words, they maintain a tradition of adding double the quantity of liquid ingredients explained in the formulae. Candrata explains that this practice of doubling of the quantity of liquid ingredients is appropriate for liquid (*drava*) that has the quantity of *kudava* or more.³⁶ The commentators Niścalakara and Śivadāsasena on Cakrapānidatta's *Cikitsāsangraha* stipulate that the quantity of sesame oil (*taila*) is one *pala* (*ca.* 48 g) on the basis of existing tradition (*vrddhavaidyasammatāt*).³⁷ Śivadāsasena's *Tattvacandrikāt*ikā presents the practice of adding one emetic nut (*madanaphala*) to the Rescue Clyster (*vaitaraṇavasti*).³⁸ This is normally added to every non-oily enema (*nirūhavasti*).³⁹ This tradition seems to be a conscious effort to grant the status of non-oily enema (*nirūhavasti*) to the Rescue Clyster.

Before further elaborating the enema formulation of Vangasena, it is helpful to look at the term *vaitaraṇa* in the Ayurvedic classics. The term *vaitaraṇa* is used as the proper name of a preceptor of surgery (*śalyatantrācārya*)

³⁵Śrīkaņṭhadatta's Vyākhyākusumāvalī (Pādhye 1894: 576): gomūtrasya kudavo 'ṣṭau palāni dravadvaiguṇyāt| nirūheṣu rasādīnām pramāṇam tu yathāśrutīti paribhāṣām punar dravadvaiguṇyaniṣedhikām nādriyante|

³⁶Candraţa on Cikitsākalikā v. 82 (Sharma 1987: 54): mūtrakudavadvitayam gomūtrasyāstaupalāni dviguņaparibhāsātra kudavād ūrdhvam kriyata iti ; Astāngahrdayasamhitā, Kalpasiddhisthāna 6.23 (Kumte et al. 1995: 775): dviguņam yojayed ārdram kudavādi tathā dravam

³⁷Ratnaprabhāțīkā on Cikitsāsangraha 71, vv. 30–31 (Sharma 1993: 863): īṣat tailam iti palam iti vyavaharanti vrddhāh|; Tattvacandrikāţīkā, ibid. (Bhaṭṭācārya and Bhaṭṭācārya 1993: 891): īṣat śabdena tailapalam iti vyavaharanti vrddhāh|

³⁸*Tattvacandrikāțīkā* (Bhațțācārya and Bhațțācārya 1993:891): *atrāpi* madanaphalam ekaņi deyam ity āhuh

³⁹Candraţa citing Kharanāda (Sharma 1987: 54): tathā ca kharanādaļ – ata ūrdhvam pravakşyāmi nirūhasya prakalpanam dvādaśaprasrtān ādye tato 'nyāms tu prakalpayet sarveşv eva nirūheşu madanam ca prakalpayet sneham gudam mākşikam ca lavanam cāpi yuktitah

in the *Suśrutasamhitā*.⁴⁰ Some have argued that the name in Vangasena refers to this preceptor Vaitarana. Yet, few references to the works of Vaitarana are seen in the commentaries of Śrīdāsapaņdita,41 or Cakrapāņidatta.42 The extrapolation of Preceptor Vaitarana to the context of clinical enema does not help much to round out our understanding of the composition and practice of enema (vasti). Instead, I suggest that the term *vaitarana* was coined by Vrnda as a conventional technical term (pāribhāsikasam $i\tilde{n}a$).⁴³ Vangasena seems to be making an obvious reference to the Rescue Clyster (vaitaranavasti) mentioned in previous treatises like the Vrndamādhava, when he uses the phrase "together with the collection of qualities mentioned for a vaitarana" (vaitaranoktagunaganayuktam).44 And his adjective "famous" (*suvikhyāta*) at the same place appears to be an acknowledgement of its time-tested usage and acceptance among physicians.

Vangasena contends that his substitution of cow's urine (*gomūtra*) (which has the pungent taste (*kațurasa*) and the

⁴⁰*Suśrutasaṃhitā, sūtrasthāna* 1, 3 (Ācārya 1938: 1).

⁴¹Śrīdāsapaņdita (14th century) commenting on the Astāngahrdayasamhitā, sūtrasthāna, 1.14 (Mooss 1940: 47): vaitaraņenāpy uktam – 'prāņinām mūlam āhārah śarīropacayasya sa ... rasesu sadāyatto rasā dravyāśritāh smrtāḥ'| and he also quotes a Vetaraņa in sūtra 20.16: uktam ca vetaraņena – raktapittavikāresu pittaprakrtaye tathā| kāle cosņe viseseņa vinā svedam prayojayet|

 $^{^{42}}$ See Cakrapāņidatta's comments on *Suśrutasaņhitā* sū.18.9–11 and 17–18 (Ācārya and Śarman 1939:139, 141). [On Vaitaraņa as a person, see further Meulenbeld 1999–2002: IA, 371 – ed.]

⁴³A *pāribhāṣikasaņijñā* is a technical term that directly refers to an object and has neither a generic feature (*jāti*) nor an attribute (*upādhi*) as the basis of reference.

⁴⁴See note 22 above, v. 189. A syntactic analysis (*vigraha*) of the term *vaitaraņokta* would be *vaitaraņāya uktaņ* in the dative case (*caturthīvi-bhakti*), and not "stated by Vaitaraņa" (*vaitareņe uktaņ*) using the instrumental (*trtiyā*).

dry, non-oily quality ($r\bar{u}ksaguna$)) with cow's milk ($goks\bar{u}r\bar{a}$) - which is sweet (madhura) and viscous (snigdha) - will not alter the clinical efficacy of the popular Rescue Clyster (vaitaranavasti). This modification seems to be done to suit the patient, who is in a state where oil depletion ($r\bar{u}ksat\bar{a}$) predominates and strength (bala) is reduced. Candrata advises that when physicians perform an oil-depletion enema (rūksavasti) in cases associated with obstruction (āvarana) and in unobstructed (nirāvarana) conditions, the enema (vasti) should be prepared by adding one pala (48 g) of sesame oil (taila).⁴⁵ Ādhamalla, the commentator on the Śārngadharasamhitā, who closely follows Vangasena, refers to the enema (vasti) preparation as Milk Rescue Clyster (ksīravaita*ranam*).⁴⁶ This substantiates my hypothesis that Vangasena modified the Rescue Clyster (vaitaranavasti) by substituting cow's urine (*gomūtra*) with cow's milk (*goksīrā*).

Formulæ for *vaitaraņavasti* available from various treatises and commentaries

Formula 1

According to the reading of *Vṛndamādhava*, the *Cikitsāsan*graha, and the *Āyurvedasaukhya*, the ingredients are:

⁴⁵Candrața, commenting on *Cikitsākalikā* 82 (Sharma 1987: 54): *sāva-raņe rūkṣam*| *nirāvaraņe tailapalānvitaṃ*|

⁴⁶Ādhamalla, commenting on Śārngadharasamhitā uttarakhanda 5.16-18 (Śāstrī 1931: 323): yasya ca virecanam nocitam samcitam ca malam bastim tasya ca tanmalāpagamārthaksiravaitaranam vā bastim dattvānuvāsanam deyam trišuddhasya snehavastyupadešāt I ti si interesting to note that Ādhamalla closely follows Śrīkanthadatta, but replaces the term vaitaraņa ("clyster") with ksīravaitaraņa ("milk-clyster").

sea salt (<i>saindhava</i>)	karṣa	12 g
jaggery (<i>guḍa</i>)	śukti	24 g
tamarind (<i>amlikā</i>)	pala	48 g
sesame oil (<i>taila</i>)	īsat	small amount
sesame oil (<i>taila</i>)	īșat	small amount
cow's urine (<i>gomūtra</i>)	kuḍava	240 ml

Formula 2

According to the variant reading of the *Vṛndamādhava*, jaggery (*guḍa*) is replaced by *hiṅgu*:

sea salt (<i>saindhava</i>)	karṣa	12 g
hingu	śukti	24 g
tamarind (<i>amlikā</i>)	pala	48 g
sesame oil (taila)	īṣat	small amount
cow's urine (gomūtra)	kuḍava	240 ml

Formula 3

According to the *Āyurvedasāra* of Acyuta:

sea salt (saindhava)kargjaggery (guḍa)paltamarind (amlikā)47palsesame oil (taila)palcow's urine (gomūtra)kuḍa	a 48g a 48g a 48g
---	-------------------------

⁴⁷Śivadāsasena, commenting on caustic enema ($k \saravasti$), explains the term *amlikā* as the *amlikāyā iti sāstitintidiphalasya* that is to take the tamarind (*amlikā*) along with its seeds. This is not seen in practice in Kerala.

We can stipulate the quantity of sesame oil (*taila*) is one *pala* on the basis of the *Niścalakara* and the *Śivadāsa*. Regarding the quantity of cow's urine (*gomūtra*), *Niścalakara* is silent; but both *Śrīkaṇṭhadatta* and *Śivadāsa* take it as eight *palas* (*aṣṭapala-*) by sticking to the rule of interpretation (*paribhāṣā*) concerning double-measures of fluids (*dravadvaigu-nya*).

- 1. Formula 1 is further modified by adding one emetic nut (*madanaphala*) to the enema formulation in line with the tradition quoted by *Śivadāsa*.
- 2. In the compendium of Vangasena, where the cow's urine (*gomūtra*) is replaced by *gokṣīra*.

In our clinical experience we observed that the use of one *pala* of sesame oil (*taila*), rather than the current practice of taking two *palas* of sesame oil (*taila*), has resulted in better outcomes.⁴⁸ This demands a well-designed study of various formulations of *vaitaraṇavasti* for establishing its relative clinical efficacy and thereby standardising the formula of *vaitaraṇavasti*.

Indication

The number of conditions where Rescue Clyster (*vaitaraņa-vasti*) is therapeutically indicated increases in texts that come after Vaṅgasena, as shown in Table 7.3. And we can see a similar increase in conditions indicated for treatment

⁴⁸Syamakrishan *et al.* in preparation. Here in some cases the liquid is replaced by sour rice-gruel (*dhānyāmla*) as it can be made available easily and more importantly in a sterile form when compared to cow's urine (*gomūtra*). This also yielded very good results, suggesting that a formula for an enema (*vastiyoga*) can be regarded as a model and a physician can modify it according to the clinical conditions in which it is administered.

Verse	Indication	VT	С	Ā	V
1	acute pain (<i>śūla</i>)	+	+		+
2	strangury (<i>ānāha</i>)	+	+		
3	constipation (<i>āmavāta</i>)	+	+		+
4	dropsy (<i>śotha</i>)			+	
5	sluggish digestion (mandāgnitā)			+	
6	pelvic stiffness (grdhrasī)			+	+
7	knee-contraction (jānusankoca)			+	+
8	muscular rigidity (<i>samstambha</i>)			+	
9	irregular fever (<i>visamajvara</i>)			+	+
10	swelling of the hip, thigh and back				+
	(kaţyūrupṛṣṭhaśotha)				
11	persistent torpor of the thigh (<i>cira</i> -				+
	bhavam ūrustambha)				
12	impotence (klaibya)				+

Table 7.3: VT= Vṛnda/Toḍara, C = Cakra, \overline{A} = $\overline{A}yurvedas\overline{a}ra$, V = Vaṅgasena

by the decoction of yellow-fruit nightshade, etc. (*vyāghryā-dikvāthā*).⁴⁹

Time of administration

Vṛnda and Vaṅgasena explain that *vaitaraṇavasti* can be administered to all types of patients.⁵⁰ It may even be given after eating, which deviates from the general norm of ad-

⁴⁹Vāgbhaṭa mentions wind-phlegm fever (*vātakaphajvara*), wheezing (*śvāsa*), cough (*kāsa*), catarrh (*pīnasa*), and acute pain (*śūla*) as indications. The *Cikitsāsangraha* and the *Śārangadharasamhitā* (*Śāstrī* 1931: 151) add facial paralysis (*ardita*), lingering fever (*jīrmajvara*), loss of appetite (*aruci*), loss of voice (*vaisvaryam*), and indigestion (*ajīrana*). Govindadāsa adds night fever (*rātrijvara*). Niścalakara reports its high efficacy in old catarrh (*purānapīnasa*).

⁵⁰See n. 22 above, verse 190.

ministering non-oily enemas (*nirūhavasti*).⁵¹ It may also be given in the evening. If the strength of the patient is good, then this enema can be given even on empty stomach, although most authorities favour the administration of the Rescue Clyster (*vaitaraṇavasti*) after eating.⁵²

Conclusion

In the *Nirukta*, Yāska's ancient work on lexicography and scriptural hermeneutics (*ca*. 5th century BCE), the author says that when the direct seers of the hymns or mantras had passed away, the people approached the gods and asked them about how to fill the void created by the absence of the seers. Then, Yāska answered his own question by saying that etymology (*nirukta*) or reasoning (*tarka*) was transmitted to the people by the gods to fill the void. If the mantras are grasped in the light of the *Nirukta*, then this science is capable of revealing the meaning of the mantras as they were communicated to the original seers.⁵³ The *Niru*-

⁵³Nirukta pariśista 13.12 (Sarup 1967: 227): manuşyā vā rşişūtkrāmatsu devān abruvan| ko na rşir bhavişyatīti| tebhya etam tarkam rşim prāyacchan mantrārthacintābhyūham abhyūļham| tasmād yad eva kimcānūcāno 'bhyūhaty ārşam tad bhavati| [For the same concept in the main body of the Nirukta, cf. section 1.20 (Sarup 1967: text pp. 41–42, tr. p. 20) sākṣātkrtadharmāṇa ... vedam ca vedāngāni ca. – ed.]

⁵¹Cakradatta 71.31cd (Sharma 1993:863): vaitaraņaļ kṣārabastir bhukte cāpi pradīyate

⁵²Ratnaprabhāțīkā commentary on Cakradatta 71.30–31 (Sharma 1993: 863): atyantaśūlapīdāyām bastidvayam idam bhukte 'pi dīyatā ity āha vaitaraņa ity ādi| etad āvasthikam vidhānam na tv autsargikam, bhukte nirūhasyeti doṣakartṛtvāt| kin tu bhukte kṣārabastir na punaś carati, vaitaranaḥ punaḥ svasthāvasthāyām pracaraty eva|

Tattvacandrikāţīkā commentary, ibid. (Bhaţţācārya and Bhaţţācārya 1933: 891): atyantaśūlapīdāyām bastidvayam idam bhukte 'pi dīyatā ity āha vaitarana ity ādi atyantaśūlapīdāvasthāyām āvasthikam idam vidhānam bodhyam, na tu sārvakālikam, bhukte nirūhasyātidoṣalatvāt kim tu bhukte kṣāravastir na pracarati, vaitaranas tu caraty eva

kta provides the missing link and the creative organization of Vedic students, and it is hailed as a sacred teaching that sanctions creative investigation ($\bar{u}ha$ -brahma).⁵⁴ Kharanāda noted that when specifics are not mentioned in the texts one must rely on the clinical experience of learned physicians, and use appropriate quantities of drugs after proper assessment of a patient's humours (doşa) and observable variables.⁵⁵ By combining these two methods we can design novel paradigms in our research and clinical practice and move forward in new and fruitful directions.

The study of the textual sources of Ayurvedic practice not only helps us to understand the work of indologists, historians, linguists, and philosophers, it also directly benefits our clinical practice and its results. We can move forward in the direction of standardising the *vaitaraṇavasti* by doing rigorous clinical research based on the available textual data.

Further reading

Ācārya, Yādavaśarman Trivikrama (ed.) 1938. Suśrutasamhitā, Suśrutena viracitā, Vaidyavaraśrī Dalhanācāryaviracitayā Nibandhasamgrahākhyavyākhyayā samullasitā, Ācāryopāhvena Trivikramātmajena Yādavaśarmannā samśodhitā. Mumbayyām: Nirnayasāgara Mudrāyantrālaye, 3rd edn.

⁵⁴Durga's commentary on the same passage (Bhadkamkar 1942: 1181): idam niruktaśāstram ūhah brahma yeṣām asti te śabdārthasamkateṣv apratibadhyamānā atikramya avidvāmsam vi-viśeṣatah sarvatraiva pratipūjyamānāh caranti tve eke ity arthah| evam etasmin mantre asyā udgāhitārthān evoddiśya mantrārthacintābhyūhasya brahmatvam śrūyate|

⁵⁵Kharaņāda quoted by Candraṭa, Cikitsākalikā 82 (Sharma 1987: 55): yasmin nirūhe nirdiṣṭāh pramāṇaṃ na ca kīrtitam| tasmin doṣādhikaṃ dṛṣṭvā yuktyā saṃvibhajed bhiṣak| madanānāṃ vimṛdyāṃśaṃ kvāthaṃ kṣīrarasādiṣu| śāstraprāptavinyāsaṃ kalpayed guruśikṣayā|

- 1941. Maharşiņā Punarvasunopadistā, tacchişyeņāgniveśena praņītā, CarakaDrdhabalābhyām pratisamskrtā Carakasamhitā, śrīCakrapāņidattaviracitayā āyurvedadīpikāvyākhyayā samvalitā. Mumbayyām: Nirņayasāgara Mudrāyantrālaye, 3rd edn.
- Ācārya, Yādavaśarman Trivikrama and Nandakiśora Śarman (eds.) 1939. Suśrutasamhitāyāh sūtrasthānam. Śrī-Cakrapāņidattaviracitayā Bhānumatīvyākhyāyā sametam = Sushrut-Sañhitā (Sūtra Sthān) with Bhānumatī Commentary by Chakrapāņi Datta with introduction by Gaṇanāth Sen, vol. 1 of Śrīsvāmi Lakṣmīrāma Nidhi Granthamālā = Shrī Swāmī Lakshmī Rām Trust Series. Agra: Śyāmasundara Śarman. Printed at the Nirṇayasāgara Press, Bombay.
- Vidyābhūsana Bhattācārya, Āśubodha and Nityabodha Vidyāratna Bhattācārya (eds.) 1933. Cakradatta Cikitsāsamgrahagranthah. Mahāmahopā-= dhyāyacarakacaturānanaśrīmacCakrapānidattena viracitah. śrīŚivadāsasenaviracitayā Tattvacandrikāsamākhyayā vuākhyayā samalankrtah. Kalikātāmahānagaryyām: The editors. Printed at the Vācaspatyayantra.
- 1993. Cakradatta = Cikitsāsamgrahagranthaņ. MahāmahopādhyāyacarakacaturānanaśrīmacCakrapāņidattena viracitaņ. śrīŚivadāsasenaviracitayā Tattvacandrikāsamākhyayā vyākhyayā samalankrtaņ, vol. 14 of Vidyāvilāsa Āyurveda Granthamālā. Vārāņasī: Caukhambhā Oriyanţāliyā. Page references are to the 1933 edition, Bhaţţācārya and Bhaţţācārya (1933).
- Bhaṭṭācārya , Jīvānanda Vidyāsāgara (ed.) 1893. *Cikitsāsārasaṃgrahaḥ. ŚrīVaṅgasenasaṅkalitaḥ.* Kalikātā: Jīvānanda Vidyāsāgara Bhaṭṭācārya at the Siddheśvarayantra, 2nd edn.
- Bhadkamkar, R. G. (ed.) 1942. The Nirukta of Yāska (With Nighaņțu) edited with Durga's Commentary, Vol. II, vol. 85

of *Bombay Sanskrit and Prakrit Series*. Bombay: R. N. Dandekar for the Dept. Public Instruction, Bombay. V.2 covers chapters 8–12, pariśiṣṭas 13 and 14, and indexes.

- Dash, Bhagwan and Lalitesh Kashyap 1980–1992. [*The Āyurveda Saukhyaṃ of the Ṭoḍarānanda*]. Ṭoḍarānanda-Āyurveda Saukhyam Series. New Delhi: Concept Publishing Company. 8 vols., each with a different title.
- 1992. Five Specialised Therapies of Ayurveda (Pancakarma) based on Ayurveda Saukhyam of Todarananda, vol. 8 of Ţoḍarānanda-Āyurveda Saukhya Series. New Delhi: Concept Publishing Company. English and Sanskrit.
- Devaraj, Therany Lakkannagowda 1972. *Keralīyapañcakarma-cikitsā-vijñānam*, vol. 65 of *Vidyābhavana Āyurveda granthamālā*. Vārāṇasī: Caukhambā Vidyābhavana, 1st edn. This provides Ārya Vaidyan S. Raghunātha Iyer Śarma's *Keralīya kriyākarma*, with Sanskrit text and Hindi translation by Dr T. L. Devraj.
- Jaina, Śaṅkaralāla (ed.) 1904. Vaṅgasena, Vaṅgasenaviduṣā viracitaḥ. Śāligrāmajīvaiśyaviracitayā bhāṣāṭīkayā samalaṅkṛtaḥ. Śaṅkaralālajainapariśodhitaḥ paripūritaś ca. Mumbaī: Khemarāja Śrīkṛṣṇadāsa Śreṣṭhinā. Reprinted 1996.
- 1996. Vangasena, Vaidyakagrantha Vangasenaviduṣā viracitaḥ. Śāligrāmajīvaiśyaviracitayā bhāṣāṭīkayā samalaṅkṛtaḥ. Śaṅkaralālajainapariśodhitaḥ paripūritaś ca. Mumbaī: Khemarāja Śrīkṛṣṇadāsa Śreṣṭhinā. Reprint of 1904 edition.
- Kṛṣṇanvaidyan, C. (ed.) 1988. *Vastipradīpaṃ by Pāṇavaļļi*. C. K. Raghavan Vaidyan at C. K. V. Hospital, Panavally: C. K. Raghavan Vaidyan, 2nd edn. First published 10/10/1108 Kollaṃ Era.
- Keśavanvaidyan, Manakoḍam K. (ed.) 1993. Pañcakarma athavā śodhanacikitsā. Cheratala: M. K. Ravindran Vaidyan, 2nd edn. First edition 1949.

- Kumte, Annā Moreśvara, Krṣṇaśāstrī Navare, and Hariśāstrī Parādkar (eds.) 1995. *Aṣṭāṅgahṛdayam, śrīmadvāgbhaṭaviracitam, śrīmadaruṇadattaviracitayā 'sarvāṅgasundaryākhyā' vyākhyayā hemādripraṇītayā 'āyurvedarasāyanāhvayā' ṭīkayā ca samullasitam, vol. 4 of Krishnadas Ayurveda Series. Vārāṇasī: Krishnadas Academy. Cited from the 2002 reprint.*
- Menon, Poyyayil Putiyedathu Raman (ed.) 1929/1930. Śrī śirassekādi vidhi with Bhāvaprabodhinī Malayalam commentary. Cranganore: Raman Menon. Date of publication given as 1105 ME.
- Meulenbeld, Gerrit Jan 1999–2002. *A History of Indian Medical Literature*, vol. XV of *Groningen Oriental Studies*. Groningen: E. Forsten. 5v.
- Mooss, Dhanwantharidas C. N. Narayanam (ed.) 1940. *The Ashtangahridaya composed by Vahatacharya, with the commentary of Sreedasapandita, Part I,* vol. 4 of *Sri Chithra Ayurveda Series.* Trivandrum: Government Press.
- Mooss, N. S. 1983. *Ayurvedic treatments of Kerala*, vol. E-5 of *Vaidyasarathy Series*. Kottayam: Vaidyasarathy Press, 3rd edn.
- Muthuswami, N. E. (ed.) 1976. Rasavaiśeṣikasūtra, Bhadanta Nāgārjunaviracitam, Narasimhakṛtabhāṣyopetam, vol. 2 of Kerala Government Ayurvedic Publication Series. Trivandrum: Govt. Ayurveda College.
- Nīlakaņṭhaśarma, T. and Yādavaśarman Trivikrama Ācārya (eds.) 1913. *Dhārākalpa*. Bombay: Yādavaśarman Trivikrama Ācārya.
- Nambiyār Vaidyar, P. Cāttukkuṭṭi (ed.) 1960. *Yogāmṛtaṃ: Saṃpūrṇa Yogāmṛtaṃ*. Kannur: Srisadan Ayurveda Oushadhasala.
- Pādhye, Haņamantaśāstrī (ed.) 1894. Vrndamādhavāparanāmakasiddhayoga, with Śrīkaņṭhadatta's commentary, vol. 27

of *Ānandāśrama Sanskrit Series*. Poona: Ānandāśrama Press.

- Raghavan, V., K. Kunjunni Raja, C. S. Sundaram, N. Veezhinathan, N. Gangadharan, et al. 1949–. New Catalogus Catalogorum, an Alphabetical Register of Sanskrit and Allied Works and Authors. Madras University Sanskrit Series. Madras: University of Madras.
- Raghunatha Iyer, Aryavaidyan S. 1972. *Keralīya pañcakarma vijnānam*. Varanasi: Chowkhambha Vidyabhavan.
- Rama Rao, B. 2005. *Sanskrit Medical Manuscripts in India*. Delhi: CCRAS.
- Rāya, Rāma Kumāra (ed.) 1983. Bangasena-samhitā (Cikitsāsāra samgraha). Hindī vyākhyākāra Rājīva Kumāra Rāya, vol. 1 of Dhanvantari Granthamālā. Vārāņasī: Prācya Prakāśana, 1st edn.
- van Rheede, Henricus 1678–1703. *Hortus Indicus Malabaricus...*. Amstelaedami: Joannis van Someren and Joannis van Dyck. 12v.
- Sarup, Lakshman 1967. *The Nighaṇṭu and The Nirukta, The Oldest Indian Treatise on Etymology, Philology, and Sementics [sic]*. Delhi, Varanasi, Patna: Motilal Banarsidass.
- Sasikumar, V. K., P. Sankarankutty, and M. R. Vasudevan Namboodiri (eds.) 1991. *A Study of Low Back Ache and its Management with Vaitaraṇavasti*. Thiruvananthapuram: Government Ayurveda College.
- Śāstrī, Paraśurāma (ed.) 1931. DāmodarasūnuŚārngadharācāryaviracitā Śārngadharasamhitā. BhişagvarĀdhamallaviracitadīpikāKāśīrāmavaidyaviracitagūdhārthadīpikābhyām, tīkābhyām, samvalitā. Mumbai: Nirņayasāgara Press, 2nd edn. References are to the 1983 reprint from Caukhambha Sanskrit Series Office, Varanasi.
- Sharma, Priya Vrat 1975. *Āyurved kā Vaijñānik Itihās*, vol. 1 of Jayakṛṣṇadāsa Āyurveda Granthamālā. Vārāṇasī:

Caukhambā Orientalia. Reference is to the 2004 reprint. Sharma, Priya Vrat (ed.) 1987. *Tīsaṭācāryakṛtā Cikitsā-kalikā* tadātmaja-śrīCandraṭapraṇītayā saṃskṛtavyākhyayā saṃvalitā, Aṅglabhāṣā-vyākhyātā tathā pariṣkartā ācārya Priyavrata Śarmā. Vārāṇasī: Caukhambā Surabhāratī Prakāśana.

- 1993. Cakradatta or Cikitsāsangraha of Cakrapāņidatta with Ratnaprabhāţīkā by Mahāmahopādhyāya Śri Niścalakara. Jaipur: Swami Jayaramadas Ramprakash Trust, 1st edn.
- Syamakrishan, G. *et al.* in preparation. "A Critical Appraisal of Evidence-based Medicine: Some Ethical Considerations with Special Reference to Effect of Vaitaraṇavasti in Low Back Ache."
- Tivārī, Premavatī (ed.) 2007. *Vṛndamādhava athavā Siddha yoga = Vṛndamādhava or Siddha Yoga: the First Treatise of Āyurveda on Treatment*, vol. 18 of *Haridas Ayurveda Series*. Varanasi: Chaukhambha Visvabharati, 1st edn. 2v.